# Random Friends Walking on Random Graphs 

Noga Alon, Princeton and TAU Joint work with Colin Defant and Noah Kravitz


Oxford, Jan. 2021

## Friends and Strangers Graphs



## Example



## Friendship Graph, example









Definition: Let X, Y be two n-vertex graphs. The Friends and Strangers Graph $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is the graph whose vertices are the bijections from $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{X})$ to $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{Y})$ where two bijections are adjacent if one can be obtained from the other by a friendly swap.

## Example:


$F S(X, Y)=2 C_{12}$

## Previous Work

For any graph $\mathrm{Y}, \mathrm{FS}\left(\mathrm{K}_{\mathrm{n}}, \mathrm{Y}\right)$ is the Cayley graph of $\mathrm{S}_{\mathrm{n}}$ generated by the transpositions corresponding to the edges of $Y$

Analyzing the 15-puzzle game is equivalent to analyzing $\mathrm{FS}\left(4\right.$ by 4 grid, $\mathrm{K}_{1,15}$ )

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 |
| 13 | 15 | 14 |  |

Wilson (74) studied the connected components of FS(X, $\mathrm{K}_{1, \mathrm{n}-1}$ ) for arbitrary X

Stanley (12) studied the connected components of $\operatorname{FS}\left(P_{n}, P_{n}\right)$.

Defant and Kravitz (20) studied the connected components of $\operatorname{FS}\left(X, P_{n}\right), F S\left(X, C_{n}\right)$ for general X

## Basic properties

Let X and Y be two n -vertex graphs
Isolated vertices of $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ correspond to edge-disjoint packings of $X, Y$ in $K_{n}$
$\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is isomorphic to $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{Y}, \mathrm{X})$
If X is disconnected so is $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$

If $\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y}$ are bipartite and $\mathrm{n} \geq 3$ then $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is disconnected

## The star graph $\mathrm{K}_{1, \mathrm{n}-1}$

When is $\mathrm{FS}\left(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{K}_{1, \mathrm{n}-1}\right)$ disconnected ?
$\mathbf{X}$ is disconnected
$X$ has a cut-vertex
$X$ is bipartite ( $n \geq 3$ )
$X$ is a cycle ( $n \geq 4$ )
[FS( $\left.C_{n}, K_{1, n-1}\right)$ has ( $\left.n-2\right)!$ components]

$\operatorname{FS}\left(\mathrm{Z}_{0}, \mathrm{~K}_{1,6}\right)$ has 6 components

Theorem (Wilson (74)): Let X be an n vertex graph, $n \geq 3$. Suppose $X$ is biconnected, neither $Z_{0}$ nor a cycle of length at least 4.

If $X$ is non-bipartite, then $\operatorname{FS}\left(X, K_{1, n-1}\right)$ is connected.

If X is bipartite then $\mathrm{FS}\left(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{K}_{1, \mathrm{n}-1}\right)$ has exactly two connected components

Proof combines the ear decomposition of a 2connected graph with some group theoretic arguments.

## Connectivity: Typical and Extremal Questions

Minimum degree
Question 1a: what is the smallest $d_{n}$ so that $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is connected for every two n -vertex graphs $X, Y$ each having minimum degree at least $d_{n}$ ?

Question 1b: what is the smallest $d_{\mathrm{n}, \mathrm{n}}$ so that FS(X,Y) has exactly two connected components for every two subgraphs $X, Y$ of $K_{n, n}$ each having minimum degree at least $d_{n, n}$ ?

## Random Graphs

Question 2a: Let $X, Y$ be independent binomial random graphs in $G(n, p)$. For which $p=p(n)$ is FS(X,Y) connected with high probability ?

Question 2b: Let X,Y be two independent bipartite random graphs in $G(n, n, p)$. For which $p=p(n)$ does $F S(X, Y)$ have exactly 2 connected components with high probability ?

## Results

Minimum degree
Question 1a: what is the smallest $d_{n}$ so that $F S(X, Y)$ is connected for every two n-vertex graphs $X, Y$ each having minimum degree at least $d_{n}$ ?

Theorem (A,Defant,Kravitz):

$$
\frac{3 n}{5}-2 \leq d_{n} \leq \frac{9 n}{14}+1
$$

## The lower bound



Question 1b: what is the smallest $d_{n, n}$ so that $F S(X, Y)$ has exactly two connected components for every two subgraphs $\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y}$ of $\mathrm{K}_{\mathrm{n}, \mathrm{n}}$ each having minimum degree at least $d_{n, n}$ ?

## Theorem (A, Defant, Kravitz):

$$
\left\lceil\frac{3 n+1}{4}\right\rceil \leq d_{n, n} \leq\left\lceil\frac{3 n+2}{4}\right\rceil
$$

## The lower bound



## Random Graphs

Question 2a: Let $\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{Y}$ be independent binomial random graphs in $G(n, p)$. For which $p=p(n)$ is $F(X, Y)$ connected with high probability?

Theorem (A, Defant, Kravitz): The threshold $p=p(n)$ for connectivity of $F S(X, Y)$ is

$$
p(n)=\frac{1}{n^{\frac{1}{2}+o(1)}}
$$

Question 2b: Let X,Y be two independent bipartite random graphs in $G(n, n, p)$. For which $p=p(n)$ does $F S(X, Y)$ have exactly 2 connected components with high probability?

Theorem (A,Defant,Kravitz): the threshold p(n) for having two components satisfies

$$
\Omega\left(\frac{1}{n^{1 / 2}}\right) \leq p(n) \leq \widetilde{O}\left(\frac{1}{n^{\frac{3}{10}}}\right)
$$

## A bit about the proofs

Theorem: the threshold for connectivity of $\operatorname{FS}(X, Y)$ for $X, Y$ in $G(n, p(n))$ is $\mathrm{n}^{-1 / 2+o(1)}$

Fact: for $p(n) \leq \frac{2^{-\frac{1}{2}}-\epsilon}{\sqrt{n}}$ then with high probability $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is disconnected (has isolated vertices).

Proof: Sauer and Spencer (78) showed that if

$$
2 \Delta(X) \Delta(Y)<n
$$

then $X$ and $Y$ have an edge disjoint packing in $K_{n}$

The main part of the proof is:
Theorem: if $p(n) \geq \frac{\exp \left[(2 \log n)^{2 / 3}\right]}{n^{1 / 2}}$
then with high probability $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ is connected.

This is proved by showing that with high probability, for every bijection from $V(X)$ to $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{Y})$ every pair of adjacent elements $\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}$ in Y are exchangeable.

First attempt to establish that: hope that for every such $u, v$ and $f$ there is a common neighbor $w$ of $u$ and $v$ in $Y$ where $w^{\prime}=f^{-1}(w)$ is a common neighbor of $u^{\prime}=f^{-1}(u)$ and $v^{\prime}=f^{-1}(v)$.


W


But this fails with high probability for all

$$
p<1 / \sqrt{2}
$$

Second attempt: show that for every such u,v and $f$ the following two graphs appear in $X, Y$


This will suffice by Wilson's Theorem
For $p(n) \geq \widetilde{\Omega}\left(1 / n^{0.25}\right)$ this holds with high probability, by Janson Inequalities

Yet it fails for $p(n)=1 / n^{1 / 2-0(1)}$

## Need more complicated graphs


$G^{*}$

$H^{*}$

Here $\boldsymbol{m}=\left\lfloor\log \boldsymbol{n}^{2 / 3}\right\rfloor$ grows with $n$.

## Need more complicated graphs


$H^{*}$
The proof these imply exchangeability applies Wilson's Theorem several times

The (non-tight) result for the bipartite case is obtained by a similar reasoning using specific constant size pairs of graphs that supply exchangability by sequences of friendly swaps found by computer search.


## Open Problems

Is $p(n)=n^{-1 / 2+o(1)}$ the threshold for ensuring two connected components in the bipartite case too?

Is the smallest value $d_{n}$ ensuring connectivity of $F S(X, Y)$ for every pair of $n$-vertex graphs $X$ and $Y$ with minimum degree at least $d_{n}$ $3 n / 5+O(1)$ ?

Is there a hitting time result ? Namely, starting with two edgeless graphs ( $X_{0}, Y_{0}$ ) on $n$ vertices each, let ( $X_{i}, Y_{i}$ ) be a random sequence of pairs of graphs, where each $X_{i+1}$ is obtained from $X_{i}$ by adding to it a uniform random yet unchosen edge, and each $Y_{i+1}$ is defined analogously.

Let $t_{i s o}$ denote the smallest $i$ so that $\operatorname{FS}\left(X_{i}, Y_{i}\right)$ has no isolated vertices.

Let $t_{\text {con }}$ denote the smallset $i$ so that $F S\left(X_{i}, Y_{i}\right)$ is connected.

Is $\mathrm{t}_{\text {conn }}=\mathrm{t}_{\text {iso }}$ with high probability ? If not, is $t_{\text {con }}=(1+0(1)) t_{\text {iso }}$ with high probability?

## Is the diameter of any connected component of $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ at most $\mathrm{n}^{\mathrm{O}(1)}$ ?

What about the mixing properties of the random walk on $\mathrm{FS}(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{Y})$ ?
[The case $\mathrm{FS}\left(\mathrm{X}, \mathrm{K}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ is Aldous spectral gap conjecture settled by Caputo, Liggett and Richthammer (10) ]










